

УДК 352+005.6

<https://doi.org/10.62664/cpa.2024.01.04>

Oleh GONCHARUK,

Associate Professor of the Department of Public Management and
Administration,

Ivano-Frankivsk National Technical University of Oil and Gas

ORCID ID <https://orcid.org/0009-0009-7071-1776>

(© GONCHARUK O., 2024)

FOREIGN EXPERIENCE IN IMPLEMENTING QUALITY MANAGEMENT SYSTEMS IN THE PROVISION OF MUNICIPAL SERVICES

The article examines modern models of quality of local self-government bodies' activities aimed at improving the quality of municipal services: TQM schools; standardized models of management systems; models of organizational excellence; models of diagnostic self-assessment and other models aimed at achieving high quality of municipal services.

It is established that the introduction of a quality management system in the activities of local self-government bodies, created in accordance with the international standards of the ISO 9000 series, is one of the most effective methods of increasing the efficiency of local self-government bodies, improving the quality of municipal services, and identifying the needs and interests of residents of the territorial community.

The results of the study of best practices in the implementation of municipal service quality management systems in the partner cities of the UNDP Municipal Governance and Sustainable Development Program project are analysed.

Attention is drawn to such quality assessment methods as the Balanced Scorecard (BSC); the Theory of «Learning Organizations»; Knowledge Management; the Theory and practice of Change Management; and Benchmarking Technology.

The study of the peculiarities of municipal service provision suggests that it is necessary to revise the principles of selection of municipal employees who perform the functions of providing services to citizens, in addition to professional qualities, to pay attention to personal qualities, since close contact with consumers implies the influence of the human factor on service activities; it is necessary to establish public control over the provision of municipal services and ensure feedback between the subjects of municipal service provision and consumers, creation of channels for systematic submission of complaints and suggestions; delegation of customer service powers to private entities while maintaining the control functions of public authorities; implementing artificial intelligence technologies to further improve the quality of municipal services.

Keywords: *municipal service, municipal authorities, quality, quality management system, quality management of municipal services.*

Олег ГОНЧАРУК,

*доцент кафедри публічного управління та адміністрування,
Івано-Франківський національний технічний університет нафти і газу*

ORCID ID <https://orcid.org/0009-0009-7071-1776>

(© ГОНЧАРУК О., 2024)

ЗАРУБІЖНИЙ ДОСВІД ВПРОВАДЖЕННЯ СИСТЕМ УПРАВЛІННЯ ЯКІСТЮ ПРИ НАДАННІ МУНІЦИПАЛЬНИХ ПОСЛУГ

У статті розглянуто сучасні моделі якості діяльності органів місцевого самоврядування щодо поліпшення якості муніципальних послуг: школи TQM; стандартизовані моделі систем управління; моделі

організаційної досконалості; моделі діагностичного самооцінювання та інші моделі, спрямовані на досягнення високої якості муніципальних послуг.

Установлено, що запровадження в діяльності органів місцевого самоврядування системи управління якістю, створеної відповідно до міжнародних стандартів серії ISO 9000, є одним із найдієвіших методів підвищення ефективності роботи органів місцевого самоврядування влади, поліпшення якості муніципальних послуг, ідентифікації потреб і інтересів мешканців територіальної громади.

Проаналізовано результати вивчення кращих практик упровадження систем управління якістю муніципальних послуг у містах-партнерах проєкту ПРООН «Муніципальна програма врядування та сталого розвитку».

Звернуто увагу на такі методики оцінювання якості, як збалансована система показників (Balanced ScoreCard, BSC); теорія «організацій, що навчаються» (Learning Company); управління знаннями (Knowledge Management); теорія та практика управління змінами (Change Management); технологія бенчмаркінгу.

Дослідження особливостей надання муніципальних послуг дозволяє стверджувати, що потрібно переглянути принципи добору муніципальних службовців, які реалізують функції з надання послуг громадянам, окрім професійних якостей, слід звертати увагу й на особисті якості, адже тісний контакт зі споживачами передбачає вплив людського чинника на сервісну діяльність; потрібне налагодження контролю громадськості за наданням муніципальних послуг та забезпечення зворотного зв'язку між суб'єктами надання муніципальних послуг і споживачами, створення каналів для систематичного подання скарг та пропозицій; делегування приватним структурам повноважень з обслуговування споживачів за умов збереження контрольно-наглядових функцій органів публічної влади;

упровадження технологій штучного інтелекту з метою ще більшого поліпшення якості муніципальних послуг.

***Ключові слова:** муніципальна послуга, органи муніципального управління, якість, система управління якістю, управління якістю муніципальних послуг.*

Problem statement. Today, Ukrainian citizens expect local governments to play a crucial role in the life of local communities, promote economic development and social justice in society, and improve the quality of public services. The public demand is to make the activities of state bodies and local self-government transparent and free from corruption. However, in many Ukrainian cities this problem is difficult to solve due to imperfect management systems of local governments. Therefore, it is currently advisable to apply management methods and tools used in business to public authorities and local governments [1].

Effective management practices and crosscutting, integrated and innovative governance approaches enhance territorial development and can help governments at all levels improve services to citizens. This is particularly true for the local level, where policies meet people.

Analysis of recent research and publications. Foreign experience in implementing quality management systems in providing municipal services is revealed in the research by T. Derun, R. Ehrenberg, Ferreira Maria Patrocínia, Francisco Diniz, T. Knight, J. Sensenbrenner and many others. Particular attention should be paid to an interesting study by Joan Batlle and Montserrat, which examines the problems and prospects of introducing modern business technologies in local government.

The purpose of the article is to study foreign experience in implementing quality management systems in the provision of municipal services.

Presenting the main material. The concept of quality in the context of local self-government is related to general modernization measures that have spread in the European Union and the USA in the late 1980s. Last century, as a rule, they were related to the ideas of «new public administration» and public policy. This policy was mainly implemented in the UK. After all, these ideas influenced most of the decisions and tools that were used in the process of developing public administration policy in the following years decade.

Some of the most important ideas in particular covered two main aspects: the application of management systems used in the private sector (outsourcing, project approach, strategic planning, branding, monitoring) and the use of solutions related to results-based management in the field of financial and core activity management, the definition of goals and indicators of their achievement [6].

Modern quality management systems are represented by various concepts and models that are developed, improved, and integrated into the overall management system. They are produced with the appropriate tools and emerging methods of quality management.

Concept TQM (Total Quality Management) is considered fundamental in the quality management system in the organization, in terms of content more conceptual is understanding TQM as «quality-oriented management» [5].

Total quality management is an approach to managing an organisation that combines resources, management methods and technical means into a scientifically based system aimed at continuous improvement of activities and results of these activities. The accepted abbreviation for the concept of «total quality management» is TQM (*Total Quality Management*). The TQM concept covers all divisions of the organisation, all types of activities and is aimed at using material, technical and human resources to meet the needs of customers, society and employees of the organisation in the most efficient way. The TQM concept can be used in an organisation of any type of activity, and, as

international experience shows, contributes to improving the quality of labour performance.

Thus, total quality management is a quality-oriented approach to managing an organisation that is based on the participation of all its members (staff in all departments and at all levels of the organisational structure) and is aimed at achieving both long-term success by meeting customer requirements and benefits for the organisation's members and society [1].

Total Quality Management (TQM) is based on a definition of quality. The definition comes from consumer psychology literature. Local administration found TQM very attractive in the sense that it promotes understanding of community needs. TQM helps the administration contain costs public and to improve the services. Local administration may benefit from TQM insofar as it may become a means to increase responsibilities, and diminish revenues and the public's cynicism regarding civil servants' skills [13, p. 64].

Total Quality Management (TMQ) takes up again some main ideas from theories dating back from the beginning of the XX century, but its main concern though is to produce quality. Producing quality, however, is no longer a notion dealing exclusively with manufacturing goods or using techniques. It means now a management model. The check and statistic control oriented quality concept includes many functions such as: continuous improvement, infallibility, participated management, continuous training, human resources development, giving or delegating authority, and, especially providing leadership, motivation and commitment together with a strategic vision based on planning and management processes meant to meet the clients' expectations [8].

The implementation of TQM has to be planned. It is a product of a direct decision by the management, which in this case are the politicians from the local administration. The decision is made based on citizen's initiative, or initiative of a group of citizens within the bodies of the public administration. It can often be a result of the leadership's initiative. The main reasons for making such a

decision are based on: Reduction of the costs of operation; Bigger efficiency of departments of the administration; Bigger productivity; Improvement of the image of the institution; Improvement of the working conditions of the employees; and Improvement of planning [16].

According to Lewin implementing TQM means undergoing a profound organizational change. He suggests that when two opposite forces – one urging to introduce the change and another striving to keep the status quo – are equally strong it is possible to speak of a «quasi equilibrium» which will only be disrupted if the former becomes stronger than the latter. As Lewin sees it, change is a three step process during which one has to: a) Reduce the forces by providing information which shows the difference between actual and ideal behaviour; b) Induce new behaviours, values and attitudes through changes in the structure and in the process; c) Enhance a new state of equilibrium by reinforcing values, norms and the organizational culture [7].

The use of a quality management system involves considering the activity of the local selfgovernment body as a set of interconnected processes. They contribute orderliness of activity and allow management to more clearly understand tasks and functions structural subdivisions and the local self-government body as a whole.

Implementation of the quality management system in local self-government bodies includes the development and approval of the specified documents and personnel training. Necessary to form a list of mandatory documents specified by the local self-government body. This can be done by analyzing those areas of activity to which the standard applies ISO 9001 has established requirements, in particular regarding the definition, description, and management of processes and documents; responsibility leadership; management of resources and provision of services; permanent improvement of activities through the formation of appropriate mechanisms of control, assessment, analysis data, and information and decision-making [5].

Standardized quality management models are currently represented by the ISO 9001 model, which sets minimum requirements for quality management systems, and models of international standards for other management systems that are compatible with the ISO 9000 series. The world's most recognized models of organizational excellence (models of «ideal organizations»), on the basis of which regional, national and international competitions are held, are: the model of the Edward Deming National Award (Japan, 1950); the model of the Malcolm Baldrige National Award (USA, 1987); the model of the European Foundation for Quality Management – EFQM (Europe, 1991).

The ISO 9000 standard is one of the models for managing the organization's activities to ensure its effectiveness. The ISO 9001:2015 standard is one of the most popular standards developed by the International Organization for Standardization. It is accepted in more than 170 countries of the world. Note that the ISO 18091:2020 standard was adopted in November 2020. This standard guides for local government entities to understand and implement a quality management system that meets the requirements of ISO 9001:2015, as well as the needs and expectations of their citizens and other relevant stakeholders. Four areas of activity in the field of quality of public services can be distinguished, with the help of which the quality system in local self-government bodies affects the process of forming the quality of products and services at various stages of their life cycle: planning, which includes activities to establish goals and requirements for quality and application quality system elements; management, which includes methods and types of operations of an operational nature, used for implementation of quality requirements: quality control, development, and implementation of process correction measures; provision (internal or external), which includes all planned and systematically implemented types of activities within the framework of the quality system, necessary for the creation and confirmation of sufficient certainty that a product, process, or service satisfies installed quality requirements; improvement, which includes all measures

carried out in the organization to increase the efficiency and effectiveness of activities and processes for obtaining profit for the organization and benefit consumers. Each field of activity has its features, and together they are four of the main one's functional subsystems of the quality system [6].

Quality of the housing and municipal services and management in the partnering cities is getting better due to the implementation of the Project *Municipal Governance and Sustainable Development Program*. Municipal services quality management system ISO 9001:2000 has been implemented in Voznesensk in 2007–2008 supported by UNDP. This year implementation of ISO 9001:2008 will be supported in Kirovske, Dolyna, Novograd-Volynskiy and Dzhankoy. Besides this, the Project also helps to create an interactive modern official web pages of partnering City Councils (14 web pages have been created). Development of cities is also being fostered by Municipal Support Units, which report directly to the Mayor of the city and so can get projects implemented very fast. The Programme conducts trainings on decentralisation, strategic and operational management for municipal servants working in the bodies of local self-governance and involvement of local communities in the decision making process [14, p. 7].

Due to the Programme, institutional capacity of these organisations is growing steadily, developing their ability to plan, mobilise resources and identify priorities in order to address their social, economic and environmental problems, which in turn finally allows them to achieve Millennium Development Goals. This process is supported by relevant municipal councils and other national/international development agencies. City councils include community plans in their own development plans and allocate resources for their implementation. Thus, the process of local sustainable development is going from the bottom up – from local to national level.

The most effective way to experience the benefits of people's unions and their community organisations is through small grants to implement community

infrastructure projects to address their priority issues for local development. For six years the Project has been supporting 232 local communities' initiatives. 55% of these 232 initiatives are related to energy conservation and environment improvements (reconstruction of sewage, water supply, heating systems, installation of energy-efficient windows in schools, repair of toilets in kindergartens, etc.). 45% of implemented projects were in the social sphere, for example, repairing the facades of schools, the construction of sport fields or pump rooms with good drinking water. The cost of approved projects reached UAH 26,3 mln. Almost 50 000 residents benefited from these initiatives [14, p. 11].

In Ivano-Frankivsk by the end of 2009 with partnership support of UNDP 95 projects have been implemented. The best experience worth attention are: including priority directions, defined by bodies of selforganisation of population (BSPs), ACMHs, charity organisations into the list of tasks or the annual social and economic development programme; creation of Resource Centre for supporting UNDP/MGSDP projects implementation; development of the municipal programme «Energy saving and energy efficiency in Ivano-Frankivsk for 2010–2013»; city delegations exchange on the basis of the implemented projects in the cities which are taking part in the programme under support of West-East; usage of the experience gained during project implementation, human resources mobilisation in order to introduce other social projects including «Improvement of effective solid household waste collecting, sorting and recycling system management in Ivano-Frankivsk and region»; building of kids', sports' and containers' grounds at the places suggested by BSPs [14, p. 39].

In world and national practice, quality assurance of processes and services in municipal administration is carried out through a systematic combination of the following four elements: introduction of public service standards; introduction of quality management systems (QMS); application of the Common

Assessment Framework (CAF) or other models of organizational excellence; dissemination of positive practices and benchmarking [2].

Another interesting model is Lean management. Lean management is a philosophy that has been extensively used since the 1980s by Japanese automotive manufacturers to gain a competitive advantage over their Western rivals. One of the most prominent and widely known implementations of a lean management approach goes back to the Toyota Motor Corporation. Many academics and practitioners consider the «Toyota Way» as one of the first lean management frameworks implemented in an organization.

Lean is a philosophy and methodology to maximize customer value and staff engagement. For municipalities, this is about creating citizen value while reducing the unnecessary waste and inefficiency. When an organization is using the Lean approach, it is seeking to understand how customer value is achieved and continuously improving the key processes to increase that value. The ultimate goal is to ensure perfect value to the customer through a value creation process that eliminates waste.

When understood, Lean helps to reform the all too typical management focus on optimizing separate and/or individual technologies, assets, and vertical departments and, instead, directly focuses the flow of products and services through value streams (end-to-end processes), moving horizontally across technologies, assets, and departments, and eventually on to customers.

Eliminating waste along an entire value stream, as described in the sidebar, instead of at isolated points, creates processes that require less non-value human effort, less space, less capital, and less time to make products and deliver services [12].

For municipalities, Lean represents an opportunity for service managers to focus on better analyzing business activities and assist in making sound decisions to optimize service delivery for the citizens of your community. It is important to understand that Lean is not a solely management-driven exercise,

but one that requires the engagement of staff in solutions that focus on «system» level improvements instead of «point» improvements.

For too long, many municipal organizations have dedicated significant time and energy on «point» level improvements that, in the end, result in a degree of «exciting chaos». However, these impacts made at the «point» may not have the same positive impact upstream and downstream – thus, the citizen may see very little positive impact and possibly see a negative impact. Inherent within Lean is a focus on the «system» level improvement to ensure an *organizational* perspective – one where impacts are throughout the entire business process and the positive impacts will be measurable on the bottom line, as well as in respect of the quality/level of service experienced by the client/citizen [12].

Here are some examples of the implementation of Lean management methods in local government.

In 2012, the state of Wisconsin launched a Lean initiative aimed at reducing workload, accelerating permitting timelines and improving efficiency within its Department of Natural Resources. One of the key projects was to improve the process for wild game serving permits, which regulate the serving of certain foods at specific locations, such as restaurants or hotels.

With the objectives of simplifying the process, making it more customer-friendly and reducing staff work time, the Lean project began with a thorough mapping of the current process. A close examination of the value stream revealed several steps that could be eliminated or streamlined. It also revealed circumstances under which permits weren't necessary by law – and could thus be removed from the queue – while pinpointing the key causes for delays.

Over the course of six months, the department achieved substantial success. Staff workload for each permit, measured in minutes, was cut in half. The approval process was simplified to involve only one agency instead of two. Lead time for permit processing was reduced from seven days to two days, and

customer satisfaction improved from mixed or indifferent sentiment to positive sentiment.

In 2014, the state of California began offering a six-month Lean Six Sigma training program to employees of various state departments, designed to address process-based issues causing service delays. In the following years, program participants have completed dozens of Lean implementation projects, including the Central Valley Regional Water Quality Control Board.

This government entity set out to reduce the average time required to issue preliminary drafts for pollutant discharge elimination system permits, which regulate the discharge of certain pollutants into water. At the project's outset, the average permit completion time was 170 calendar days, with no permits completed in less than 45 days. As the drafting process was mapped and analyzed for value and efficiency, wastes were identified and eliminated.

Total steps in the process were decreased from 31 to 26, and review steps were cut from 11 to 5. Processes were standardized across offices and key steps were moved to earlier in the flow. With these adjustments, the department now completes 95% of permits within 45 days [4].

Implementation of Key Performance Indicators / Balance Score Card evaluation systems. The Balanced Scorecard (BSC) is a management system specifically for evaluating more than just the financial aspects of companies, in order to make decisions based on other valuable aspects. The concept was introduced in 1992 by accountant Robert S. Kaplan and business theorist David Norton and has since become one of the most popular methods of goal evaluation and business management.

The process of creating and implementing a Balanced Scorecard begins by determining several critical parameters of the organization, such as:

Identification of the desired objectives by company management.

Determining the appropriate indicators to measure the objectives' level of success.

Establishing concrete goals based on the results of the indicators.

Designing specific initiatives, projects, or activities to achieve goals.

When all this is established and clarified throughout the organization, the next step is to place all metrics, objectives, goals, and driving factors in a software-generated chart where each action is tracked.

The Balanced Scorecard is an approach to developing strategic goals of an organization and evaluating the organization from four strategic perspectives: finance, customers, internal processes, training and development. The BSC is based on establishing cause-and-effect relationships between strategic goals, parameters that reflect them, and factors that lead to planned results. The BSC translates the organization's mission and strategy into a system of clearly defined goals and objectives, expressed in terms of indicators that allow to determine the degree of achievement of strategic objectives. Each answer of the four strategic points of view is represented by goals, indicators, objectives and initiatives [3].

Knowledge management is about building organisational intelligence by enabling people to improve the way they work in capturing, sharing and using knowledge. It involves using the ideas and experience of employees, customers and suppliers to improve the organisation's performance. Building on what works well leads to better strategy, practice and decision-making.

Knowledge management can help identify and manage gaps in the ways that knowledge circulates within an organisation. It also assists in identifying future knowledge required within an organisation in changing circumstances, for example, when an employee retires. For employees retiring or leaving, a structured approach to knowledge management provides an opportunity to leave a «legacy» of their acquired learning. It also ensures that key corporate knowledge is captured, and not lost when the person leaves. For public sector organisations, this helps to ensure consistent and improved service delivery to citizens. Knowledge management aims to enhance the ability of an organisation to share or «transfer» knowledge between individuals or groups. Knowledge

transfer is most effective when there is a planned approach to knowledge management. The key to success for knowledge management is the ability or willingness of an organisation to collaborate at all levels so learning and knowledge transfer can occur. The alternative is a situation in which knowledge and information is not shared and collaboration is limited: the outcome is that information is only stored and soon becomes redundant over time [11].

Knight and Howes suggest that organisations frequently come to knowledge management because they have spotted a gap in how well the organisation does things and look to undertake or commission some work to address this. It could be a database, intranet, discussion board, or some kind of specialist software deployment. Such initiatives are often labelled as «knowledge management» but in reality they are focused on new ways to organise information. Furthermore, big infrastructure initiatives, such as the development or improvement of the intranet site, frequently fail in their objective of promoting internal communication and knowledge sharing. When this happens, the issues are seldom technical, rather the sites are not fulfilling their potential due to employees not using them. Knight and Howes [10, p. 29] conclude that unless knowledge management interventions are «firmly embedded into the culture and processes of organisations, and appropriate reward and motivation systems are in place, they will fail to deliver what the architects promised of them».

Beckhard and Harris (1987) present a three-stage model that focuses on defining the present and the future, managing the transition, and maintaining and updating the change. Special consideration is given to some of the issues associated with the moving or transitional stage, including the need for transitional arrangements, such as the appointment of a transition manager and the development of transition plans, and the gaining of commitment from key stakeholders. They also consider the conditions required to maintain the change. These models highlight the importance of: Developing change relationships:

between change agents and those affected by the change. Diagnosis: change managers need to give attention to where the organization is now and to what a more desirable (and attainable) state would look like. Strategies and plans: to move the organization towards the desired state. Implementation: translating intentions (strategies and plans) into actual change efforts. Maintaining the change: and holding on to gains.

The management of change poses many challenges for managers. Burnes observes that: Managing and changing organizations appears to be getting more rather than less difficult, and more rather than less important. Given the rapidly changing environment in which organizations operate, there is little doubt that the ability to manage change successfully needs to be a core competence for organizations [15, p. 88].

Benchmarking technology in local self-government. Benchmarking is the practice of comparing key performance measures, trends, and management processes with peer organizations. It is an invaluable tool for measuring your performance successes and potential areas for improvement.

Benchmarking, technique of governance designed to improve the quality and efficiency of public services. In essence, benchmarking involves comparing specific aspects of a public problem with an ideal form of public action (the benchmark) and then acting to make the two converge. By making comparisons in this way, public administration is supposed to improve through processes of learning and emulation.

Of course, public administrations have always learned in the sense that they have changed as a reaction to evolving political, social, and economic circumstances. Since the 1980s, however, the conceptualization and systematic application of benchmarking has accelerated this process using ideas from the management of private businesses. Subsequently, at least three levels of usage of benchmarking can be identified. First, this technique has been used to encourage learning and emulation within organizations such as ministries and

local authorities. Second, benchmarking has been used to encourage competitive learning between service providers, such as schools in the United Kingdom. Third, benchmarking concerns the transfer of policy instruments between states. Benchmarks are used frequently, for example, by international organizations such as the World Bank when encouraging administrative reforms in African countries.

Two different methodological approaches to benchmarking can be discerned. The first involves the sharing of standardized data on performance in specific issue areas – for example, equal pay for women. Here, statistics are used to encourage, or even politically embarrass, protagonists into striving to reach or surpass a benchmark. A second method is more qualitative, involving either self-assessment (particularly through responses to questionnaires) or organizational analysis carried out by independent researchers or consultants.

Benchmarking is a business management practice used mainly for marketing and sales purposes that has been applied in many different fields such as, for instance, education, industrial development or country development. It refers to performing systematic comparisons with competitors in order to visualize the leadership and the positioning of a company within a list or ranking of companies. Applied to the field of e-government, these comparative exercises contribute to a broader view of the reform process in which public organizations are undergoing, identify leaders and followers, understand different stages of growth and identify best practices at the national and international levels.

Hence benchmarking becomes over time a more common practice in public sector management, acting as a «reality check» for managers and policy-makers and allowing them to measure the progress. In a successful execution of an e-government strategy, benchmarking through indicators is a critical component of the implementation process [9, p. 35].

Conclusions. The study suggests that business technologies are increasingly penetrating the local government system; these technologies help to improve the process of providing municipal services.

Taking into account the peculiarities of business technologies in the implementation of projects to introduce quality-based management elements in municipal governments should help to change the organisational culture, foster a culture of quality and respect for the consumer of municipal services.

The quality of processes and services in municipal administration is ensured through a systematic combination of the following four elements: implementation of public service standards; implementation of quality management systems (QMS); application of the Common Assessment Framework (CAF) or other models of organisational excellence; and dissemination of good practices and benchmarking.

СПИСОК ВИКОРИСТАНИХ ДЖЕРЕЛ

1. Бондаренко С. М., Касич А. О. Використання концепції загального управління якістю (TQM) в органах місцевого самоврядування. URL: <http://www.dy.nayka.com.ua/?op=1&z=1029>.

2. Маматова Т. В. Впровадження систем управління якістю при наданні муніципальних послуг : існуючі практики та напрями вдосконалення. URL: <https://aspects.org.ua/index.php/journal/article/view/520/509>.

3. Маматова Т. В. Збалансована система показників (BSC). Енциклопедія державного управління : у 8 т. / Нац. акад. держ.упр. при Президентові України; наук.-ред. колегія : Ю. В. Ковбасюк (голова) та ін. К. : НАДУ, 2011. Т. 2 : Методологія державного управління / наук.-ред. колегія : Ю. П. Сурмін (співголова), П. І. Надолішній (співголова) та ін. 2011. С. 172–173.

4. Achieving a more efficient public sector with lean management principles. URL: <https://fourprinciples.com/expert-opinion/achieving-a-more-efficient-public-sector-with-lean-management-principles/>.
5. Derun T. M. Implementation of the quality management system in the activities of local government bodies regarding the provision of public services. URL: http://pa.stateandregions.zp.ua/archive/3_2023/26.pdf.
6. Derun T. M. System of provision of public services and quality management in local government bodies. URL: <http://perspectives.pp.ua/index.php/nauka/article/view/9004/9051>.
7. Ehrenberg R., Stupak R. Total quality management : its relation to administrative theory and organizational behavior in the public sector. *Public Administration Quarterly*. Randallstown, 1994.
8. Ferreira Maria Patrocínia, Diniz Francisco. Total Quality Management and Public Administration : The case of Vila Real Town Hal. URL: <https://core.ac.uk/download/pdf/7036347.pdf>.
9. Joan Batlle i Montserrat. Benchmarking of local e-government services and its applicability to smart city services. PhD dissertation. 2015. 168 p.
10. Knight T. and Howes T. Knowledge Management : A Guide to Good Practice. British Standards Institute. London, 2003.
11. Knowledge management : lessons for local government. URL: https://www.ipa.ie/fileUpload/Documents/Knowledge_Management_Lesson%20for_Local_Government.pdf.
12. Leveraging the power of LEAN in local government by Larry D. Côté and Jag Sharma. URL: <https://www.municipalworld.com/feature-story/leveraging-power-lean-local-government>.
13. Sensenbrenner J. Quality Comes to City Hall. Boston : Harvard Business Review, 69/2, 1991. P. 64.
14. Success stories. Making life better. Ukrainian cities' experience. Kyiv, UNDP/MGSDP, 2010. 88 p.

15. The theory and practice of change management. URL: [https://www.drnishikantjha.com/booksCollection/THE%20theory%20and%20practice%20of%20change%20management%20\(%20PDFDrive%20\).pdf](https://www.drnishikantjha.com/booksCollection/THE%20theory%20and%20practice%20of%20change%20management%20(%20PDFDrive%20).pdf).

16. Total quality management in public administration – the case of municipal government. URL: <https://cekerevac.eu/biblioteka/K34.pdf>.

REFERENCES

1. Bondarenko, S. M., Kasych, A. O. Vykorystannia kontseptsii zahal'noho upravlinnia yakistiu (TQM) v orhanakh mistsevoho samovriaduvannia – *Using the concept of total quality management (TQM) in local self-government bodies*. URL: <http://www.dy.nayka.com.ua/?op=1&z=1029>. [in Ukrainian]

2. Mamatova, T. V. Vprovadzhennia system upravlinnia yakistiu pry nadanni munitsypal'nykh posluh : isnuichi praktyky ta napriamy vdoskonalennia – *Implementation of quality management systems in the provision of municipal services : existing practices and areas for improvement*. URL: <https://aspects.org.ua/index.php/journal/article/view/520/509>. [in Ukrainian]

3. Mamatova, T. V. (2011). Zbalansovana systema pokaznykiv – *Balanced scorecard (BSC)*. *Entsyklopediia derzhavnoho upravlinnia* : u 8 t. / Nats. akad. derzh.upr. pry Prezydentovi Ukrainy; nauk.-red. kolehiia : Yu. V. Kovbasiuk (holova) ta in. K. : NADU, T. 2 : Metodolohiia derzhavnoho upravlinnia / nauk.-red. kolehiia : Yu. P. Surmin (spivholova), P. I. Nadolishnii (spivholova) ta in. 172–173. [in Ukrainian]

4. Achieving a more efficient public sector with lean management principles. URL: <https://fourprinciples.com/expert-opinion/achieving-a-more-efficient-public-sector-with-lean-management-principles/>. [in English]

5. Derun, T. M. (2023). Implementation of the quality management system in the activities of local government bodies regarding the provision of

public services. URL: http://pa.stateandregions.zp.ua/archive/3_2023/26.pdf. [in English]

6. Derun, T. M. (2024). System of provision of public services and quality management in local government bodies. URL: <http://perspectives.pp.ua/index.php/nauka/article/view/9004/9051>. [in English].

7. Ehrenberg, R., Stupak, R. (1994). Total quality management : its relation to administrative theory and organizational behavior in the public sector. *Public Administration Quarterly*. Randallstown [in English].

8. Ferreira, Maria Patrocínia, Diniz, Francisco. Total Quality Management and Public Administration : The case of Vila Real Town Hal. URL: <https://core.ac.uk/download/pdf/7036347.pdf>. [in English].

9. Joan Batlle i Montserrat (2015). Benchmarking of local e-government services and its applicability to smart city services. PhD dissertation. 168 p. [in English]

10. Knight, T. and Howes, T. (2003). Knowledge Management : A Guide to Good Practice. British Standards Institute. London. [in English]

11. Knowledge management : lessons for local government. URL: https://www.ipa.ie/fileUpload/Documents/Knowledge_Management_Lesson%20for_Local_Government.pdf. [in English]

12. Leveraging the power of LEAN in local government by Larry D. Côté and Jag Sharma. URL: <https://www.municipalworld.com/feature-story/leveraging-power-lean-local-government>. [in English]

13. Sensenbrenner, J. (1991). Quality Comes to City Hall. Boston : Harvard Business Review, 69/2, P. 64. [in English]

14. Success stories. Making life better. Ukrainian cities' experience. (2010). Kyiv, UNDP/MGSDP, 88 p. [in English]

15. The theory and practice of change management. URL: <https://www.drnishikantjha.com/booksCollection/THE%20theory%20and%20pr>

[actice%20of%20change%20management%20\(%20PDFDrive%20\).pdf.](#)

[in English]

16. Total quality management in public administration – the case of municipal government. URL: [https://cekerevac.eu/biblioteka/K34.pdf.](https://cekerevac.eu/biblioteka/K34.pdf)

[in English]

(Received on May 10, 2024)